Session 7: Critical Evaluation
Lesson 1: Course Introduction

- **Overview**
  In this session we will examine the Critical Evaluation competency and how it helps HR professionals make business decisions and recommendations that impact not only their work but their organization as a whole.

- **Due This Session**
  **Reading assignments**
  - Article: “Critical Evaluation: Put Your Analytics into Action”
  - Report: Workforce Readiness and Skills Shortages

- **Session 7 Lessons**
  - Lesson 1: Course Introduction.
  - Lesson 2: Overview of SHRM’s Competency Model.
  - Lesson 3: Definition and Components of the Critical Evaluation Competency.
  - Lesson 4: The role of Critical Evaluation in HR.
  - Lesson 5: Application of the Critical Evaluation Competency.

- **Learning Objectives**
  - Describe the three elements of SHRM’s Competency Model most applicable to senior/executive-career-level professionals.
  - Apply the concepts related to the Critical Evaluation competency to key roles and duties performed by HR professionals.
  - Explain the relevance of the Critical Evaluation competency to the job of an HR professional.
  - Identify and explain the subcompetencies and behaviors that underlie the Critical Evaluation competency.
  - Analyze the role that the Critical Evaluation competency plays in helping HR professionals address real-world issues.
  - Demonstrate the ability to apply the Critical Evaluation competency in various contexts.
Lesson 2: Overview of SHRM’s Competency Model

As discussed originally in the beginning of the early-career module, having a professionalized workforce that rests on a foundation of validated competencies helps ensure that the HR field continues to become more and more business relevant.

- **Two Types of HR Competencies**

  We will focus this senior/executive-career module on the three competencies highlighted below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nontechnical (Behavioral) Competencies</th>
<th>Technical (Foundational) Competencies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Competencies by career level:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Competency:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early-Career</td>
<td>• HR Expertise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Communication</td>
<td>• Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Relationship Management</td>
<td>• Workforce Planning and Talent Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ethical Practice</td>
<td>• Training and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Career</td>
<td>• Compensation and Benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Consultation</td>
<td>• Employee and Labor Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Critical Evaluation</td>
<td>• Employment Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior/Executive-Care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Critical Evaluation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Leadership and Navigation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Global and Cultural Effectiveness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

©2016 SHRM. All rights reserved.
Competencies for Senior/Executive-Career HR Professionals

- **SHRM Competency Model**

- **Levels of Experience**
  - Entry-Level (0-2 years)
  - Mid-Level (3-7 years)
  - Senior-Level (8-14 years)
  - Executive-Level (15 years or more)

- **Importance of the Competency**
  - As part of the creation of the new competency model, SHRM surveyed its members about their perceptions of the importance of the different competencies.
  - Over 32,000 respondents rated the importance of each competency for HR professionals to successfully perform their jobs at the identified career level.
  - The rating scale ranged from 0 to 3.

- **Importance Rating Scale**
  - 0 – Not important: Not required. No impact on job performance.
  - 2 – Important. Important impact on job performance. Would have difficulty performing effectively.
Required Upon Entry (RUE)  
Respondents also rated if proficiency in each competency was required upon entry into an HR position at the identified career level.

The rating scale ranged from 0 to 1.

RUE Rating Scale

0 – Not required upon entry/time of hire. Not expected to enter the HR profession at this level with this competency. Training provided.

1 – Required upon entry/time of hire. Expected to enter the HR profession at this level with this competency already well developed. Training not provided.

Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Career Level</th>
<th>Importance Upon Entry</th>
<th>Required Upon Entry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early</td>
<td>1.6 (.75)</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid</td>
<td>1.9 (.63)</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior</td>
<td>2.2 (.56)</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive</td>
<td>2.5 (.54)</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lesson 3: Definition and Components of the Critical Evaluation Competency

☐ Introduction
This lesson reviews the definition, description, examples and subcompetencies of the Critical Evaluation competency.

☐ Critical Evaluation Definition and Descriptions

Definition:
The ability to interpret information to make business decisions and recommendations.

Description:
Being strong in Critical Evaluation means you:
- **Evaluate** evidence. Analyze data with a keen sense for what is useful; filter the noise. Apply critical thinking, and evaluate what can be used to drive organizational success.
- **View** the issue from a variety of angles. Discuss and debate viewpoints.
- **Analyze** until you grasp the details. Gather additional information to help you make sound decisions.

Examples:
- Create a regular data discussion for HR managers to evaluate existing metrics and discuss the value and viability of alternative metrics or analytics that might benefit the organization.
- Provide opportunities to use quantitative and qualitative data as a part of decision-making.
- Encourage healthy debate.
- Ask for comparing and contrasting points of view when discussing solutions to business problems.

☐ Critical Evaluation Subcompetencies
- Measurement and Assessment Skills.
- Objectivity.
- Critical Thinking.
- Problem-solving.
- Curiosity and Inquisitiveness.
- Research Methodology.
- Decision-making.
- Auditing Skills.
- Knowledge Management.

☐ Critical Evaluation Behaviors
- Makes sound decisions based on evaluation of available information.
- Assesses the impact of changes to law on organizational human resource management functions.
 Transfers knowledge and best practices from one situation to the next.
 Applies critical thinking to information received from organizational stakeholders and evaluates what can be used for organizational success.
 Gathers critical information.
 Analyzes data with a keen sense for what is useful.
 Delineates a clear set of best practices based on experience, evidence from industry literature, published peer-reviewed research, publicly available web-based sources of information and other sources.
 Analyzes information to identify evidence-based best practices.
 Identifies leading indicators of outcomes.
 Analyzes large quantities of information from research and practice.

Ways to Develop Critical Evaluation Skills

 Debate different points of view.
 Keep current on your professional areas of expertise.
 Formulate an argument by developing points in a logical sequence that leads to a conclusion.
 Look at both strengths and weaknesses.
 Ensure that any argument, findings or results are backed by valid evidence.
 Write objectively, detaching emotion from points of view.
 Develop knowledge of HR metrics.
 Enroll in a formal statistics or research methods course.
 Be a devil’s advocate.
Lesson 4: Application of the Critical Evaluation Competency

[Introduction]

This lesson allows you to practice some of the ways to develop the critical evaluation competency discussed earlier by debating pros and cons to a potential course of action.

[The Great Debate]

- As homework you should have already created a list of pros and cons for the assigned potential course of action. Now it is time to compare your list with those of your classmates.

[Debrief]

- Was it difficult to look at only one side or the other?
- What was the advantage of being forced to look at only one side?
- What was the disadvantage of being forced to look at only one side?
- Did you have ideas for the “other” side that you couldn’t express because you were forced to view only one angle?
- Did the other team(s) capture your ideas for the opposite point of view you didn’t work on?

[Benefits, Challenges and Risks]

- What is the greatest benefit of developing this competency for:
  - The individual HR practitioner?
  - The individual’s HR department?
  - The individual’s organization as a whole?
- What is the greatest challenge to being able to develop it?
- What is the greatest risk of not developing it?
- How can a weakness in this area (i.e., with this competency) affect:
  - The individual and his or her career?
  - The individual’s HR department?
  - The individual’s organization as a whole?
Session 7: Summary

☐ Key Points from This Session

List your key points here:

☐ End-of-Session Discussion

- Which of the competencies encompassing the SHRM Competency Model do you find most intriguing?
- Which of these competencies do you think you are already skilled in?
- Which of these competencies do you think will be the most difficult for you to master? Why?

☐ Due Next Session

Reading Assignments

- Article: “Leadership and Navigation: It’s All About Teams”
- Report: Workforce Readiness and Skills Shortages